ORIGINA L RESEARCH

EFFECT OF PROGRESSIVE MUSCLE RELAXATION ON SLEEP QUALITY AMONG PATIENTS WITH CHRONIC DISEASES: A LITERATURE REVIEW

Syafa’atun Mirzanah1*, Sri Yona2, Debie Dahlia2

1Postgraduate Programme of Medical Surgical Nursing, Nursing Faculty, Universitas Indonesia
2Department of Medical Surgical Nursing, Nursing Faculty, Universitas Indonesia

*Correspondence:
Syafa’atun Mirzanah, S. Kep, Ns
Main Building Postgraduate Programme Nursing Faculty, Universitas Indonesia
Prof. Dr. Bahder Djohan Street Depok, West Java 16424 – Indonesia
Telp. (021) 78849120 Fax. (021) 7864124
E-mail: syaafat.mirza@gmail.com

Article Info:
Received: 11 February 2020
1st Revision: 25 February 2020
2nd Revision: 18 March 2020
Accepted: 24 March 2020

DOI:
https://doi.org/10.33546/bnj.1060

Abstract
Background: Sleep disturbance is prevalent among patients with chronic diseases. Thus, the use of non-pharmacological interventions is needed. Progressive muscle relaxation is considered effective to improve sleep quality, but its discussion is still limited.

Objective: To investigate the effect of progressive muscle relaxation on sleep quality among chronic disease patients.

Design: Literature review.

Data Sources: Search was performed through the CINAHL, Science Direct, and ProQuest database from 2014 to 2019 for English-based, full-text research articles.

Review Methods: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) methods was used to select articles. Critical Appraisal Skills Programme was used for quality assessment.

Results: From the 644 articles yielded, six articles were included. Progressive muscle relaxation could be given alone or in combination with cognitive behavioural therapy. It also has been proven to improve sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases regardless their ages. Procedures in progressive muscle relaxation vary, but all studies reported significant improvements on sleep quality. Most of studies used audio as a medium for progressive muscle relaxation training.

Conclusion: Progressive muscle relaxation significantly improves the sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases. It is recommended for future studies to compare the effectiveness between 4 or 7 muscle groups and 16 muscle groups on sleep quality.

KEYWORDS
progressive muscle relaxation; chronic disease; sleep; outcome assessment; health care

BACKGROUND

The prevalence of sleep disturbance among patients with chronic diseases remains high, which ranged from 2.8% to 17% according to a study in nine countries (Koyanagi et al., 2014). Sleep disturbance or poor sleep quality is higher in patients with chronic conditions than those with non-chronic conditions. Patients with chronic conditions with more than four diseases have a risk of sleep disturbance increased to 7.62-fold (5.88-9.87) than those with non-chronic disease. This condition is likely associated with disruption of breathing during sleep, night time awakening caused by a specific symptom of disease (nocturia in diabetes), pain, and anxiety (Koyanagi et al., 2014).

There are many bad impacts of sleep disturbance for patients with chronic diseases. In patients with haemodialysis, sleep impairment would decrease the quality of life and increase medication use and mortality rate (Elder et al., 2008). A recent study reported that poor sleep quality is associated with lower vitamin D levels (Han et al., 2017). Disturbed sleep also causes increased mortality rates, exacerbations and use of emergency department for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (Omachi et al., 2012). In diabetes, sleep impairment is associated with higher levels of HbA1c (Ohkuma et al., 2013) and increases fatigue (Zhu et al., 2018).

To treat sleep disturbance, medications have been used. However, the long-term use of sleep medication or pharmacological intervention may have side effects, and its effectiveness and safety in improving sleep quality among older people still need to be proven (Burke et al., 2018). Therefore, a non-pharmacological intervention should be provided as an alternative method of improving sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases. There are many types of non-pharmacological interventions such as physical activity, light therapy, mind-body intervention (progressive muscle relaxation, yoga), acupressure, back massage, and chamomile extract beverage for improving sleep quality (Shang et al., 2019). According to a qualitative study, progressive muscle relaxation has become the second most favourite method in improving sleep quality (Hyland et al., 2016). A previous review has also explained the effectiveness of progressive muscle relaxation in the
improvement of sleep quality in menopause women (Amanda, 2019). In addition, other reviews have discussed the use of mind body interventions (meditation, mind-body movement and relaxation) on sleep quality (Neundorf et al., 2015), and the use of the progressive muscle relaxation among cancer patients (Pelekasis et al., 2017). A review that proves the benefit of progressive muscle relaxation for patients of other chronic diseases is needed. Our review would summarize the findings of recent studies in regard to the effectiveness of progressive muscle relaxation on sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases.

METHODS

Design and Search Methods
Searching procedure was conducted through CINAHL, ScienceDirect, and ProQuest databases from 2014 to 2019 for English-based full-text research articles using specific keywords including “progressive muscle relaxation”, and “sleep”. We used Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) methods for article selection (Pati & Lorusso, 2018).

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria
The inclusion criteria were based on PICO (Population = patients with chronic diseases, Intervention = progressive muscle relaxation, Comparison = between progressive muscle relaxation and other complementary techniques, and Outcome = sleep quality). The exclusion criteria were observational studies, study protocols and review articles.

Screening
The first author did the first screening, and the other authors did the screening for content analysis.

Data Extraction
Data were extracted in the table which contains authors, participants, design, intervention, and outcome.

Quality Appraisal
We used the Critical Appraisal Skills Programme to assess the quality of research articles (Critical Appraisal Skills & Programme, 2018).

Data Analysis
A thematic analysis was used to analyse the data, with the following steps: 1) understanding data, 2) identifying codes, 3) identifying themes from the codes, 4) refinement of the themes, and 5) defining themes (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

RESULTS

Search Outcome
We yielded 520 articles from Science Direct, 25 from CINAHL, and 102 from ProQuest. Title and abstract screening were firstly done, 60 articles were excluded. There were 24 articles for full-text review, 18 of which were excluded. Finally, six articles were included (See Figure 1). Of the six articles, five studies investigated the progressive muscle relaxation alone to improve sleep quality, and one study gave progressive muscle relaxation as a part of cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT). The summary of the studies or data extraction is in Table 1.

Quality Assessment Results
Of six articles, two articles have strong validity results, two articles have moderate validity because no blinding was performed, and the others have low validity because of the absence of randomisation and blinding. There are no studies excluded based on the quality assessment (See Table 2).

Analytical Findings
Total participants in this review are 648 patients. Not all of the participants were elderly. The mean age of the participants is 55.41 years. Most of them aged more than 40 years, and majority are Asians (90.89%). The studies were conducted in Turkey (60.95%), China (15.89%), Iran (14.04%), and Spain (8.9%). Five studies were conducted in community and the other was in a hospital setting. The average of the study period is 7.6 weeks ranged from 4 to 12 weeks. But, the studies in hospital settings have shortest duration, 7 days.

Progressive muscle relaxation procedures
There were similarity and differentiation of progressive muscle relaxation procedures among all studies. The similarity lied in the duration of progressive muscle relaxation. All studies did progressive muscle relaxation for 30 minutes, but varied in terms of frequency per day and muscle groups. Progressive muscle relaxation could be done twice a day or once. For once a day, the intervention was done in the evening before sleep (Akgün Sahin & Davapoğlu, 2015; Alparslan et al., 2016). For twice a day, it was done in the morning and before sleep (Chegeni et al., 2018; Hou et al., 2014; Yilmaz & Kapucu, 2017). Various muscle groups involved in the intervention were identified. It could be 16, 7, or 4 muscle groups. Two articles applied progressive muscle relaxation using 16 muscle groups (Alparslan et al., 2016; Chegeni et al., 2018), one article using 7 muscle groups (Yilmaz & Kapucu, 2017), one article using 4 muscle groups (Akgün Sahin & Davapoğlu, 2015), and one article combined the 16, 7, and 4 muscle groups (Mateu et al., 2018).
Progressive muscle relaxation media

Various media were identified in the progressive muscle relaxation. Most of the articles used CD audio as their medium (Akgün Şahin & Dayapoğlu, 2015; Chegeni et al., 2018; Mateu et al., 2018; Yilmaz & Kapucu, 2017). Two of them used CD from the Turkish Psychologist Association, one study used CD from the Student Research Committee of Khoramabad School of Nursing and Midwifery, and the others did not clearly explain what media they used. Mp3 player was used to deliver the audio. Booklets and handbooks were still used in four studies (Akgün Şahin & Dayapoğlu, 2015; Alparslan et al., 2016; Chegeni et al., 2018; Yilmaz & Kapucu, 2017).

Progressive muscle relaxation procedures

Progressive muscle relaxation was first developed by Jacobson in 1934 as tension and relaxation of 16 muscle groups. Bernstein et al. (2000) modified progressive muscle relaxation for 7 and 4 muscle groups via counting and recall. There are three techniques of progressive muscle relaxation including Jacobson’s progressive muscle relaxation, overt progressive and covert progressive muscle relaxation. The Jacobson’s progressive muscle relaxation uses less tension of muscle than relaxation. Overt progressive muscle relaxation uses strong tension of muscle then releases it. Meanwhile, covert progressive muscle relaxation lets the tension of muscle away (Smith, 2005).

DISCUSSION

Progressive muscle relaxation procedures

Despite the variation of the procedures, there was improvement of sleep quality in most studies at the end of the studies (p<.05). One study reported no difference between control and experiment group, which was likely due to the age of the participants. In that study, most participants in the control group aged less than 50 years and those in the experiment group aged more than 50 years (Alparslan et al., 2016). Sleep impairment is probably more prevalent among older adults. The

Table 1 Summary of Included Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Design</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Control group</th>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Alparslan et al., 2016)</td>
<td>Interventional</td>
<td>Internal ward patient</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>Booklet</td>
<td>Progressive muscle relaxation</td>
<td>7 days</td>
<td>Standard care</td>
<td>PSQI</td>
<td>Significant sleep quality in experiment group (p&lt;.001), no differences between two groups at the end of research (p=.891)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hou et al., 2014)</td>
<td>RCT</td>
<td>Maintenance haemodialysis</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>CBT</td>
<td></td>
<td>12 weeks</td>
<td>Standard care</td>
<td>PSQI</td>
<td>Significant improvement of sleep quality (p&lt;.001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Mateu et al., 2018)</td>
<td>RCT crossover</td>
<td>Non-oncology</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>CD Audio</td>
<td>Jacobson progressive muscle relaxation</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
<td>Music</td>
<td>MOSS</td>
<td>Significant improvement in sleep adequacy and sleep time and decrease in sleep disturbance (p&lt;.05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Akgün Şahin &amp; Dayapoğlu, 2015)</td>
<td>Pre-experiment</td>
<td>COPD</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Handbook</td>
<td>Progressive muscle relaxation, deep breathing</td>
<td>6 weeks</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>PSQI</td>
<td>Significant improvement of sleep quality (p&lt;.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Chegeni et al., 2018)</td>
<td>RCT</td>
<td>COPD</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>Booklet, CD audio</td>
<td>Progressive muscle relaxation</td>
<td>8 weeks</td>
<td>Routine care</td>
<td>PSQI</td>
<td>Significant improvement in PSQI sub-categories: sleep quality, sleep latency, sleep duration and sleep efficiency (p&lt;.05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Yilmaz &amp; Kapucu, 2017)</td>
<td>RCT</td>
<td>COPD</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Booklet, CD audio</td>
<td>Progressive muscle relaxation</td>
<td>4 weeks</td>
<td>No intervention</td>
<td>CASIS</td>
<td>Significant improvement of sleep quality (p&lt;.01)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: RCT: Randomized Controlled Trial, CD: Compact Disk, CBT: Cognitive Behavioural Therapy, COPD: Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease, PSQI: Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index, MOSS: Medical Outcome Study-Sleep, CASIS: COPD and Asthma Sleep Impact Scale

Table 2 CASP analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Clear focused issue</th>
<th>Randomised allocation</th>
<th>Properly analysed</th>
<th>Blinding</th>
<th>Similar start</th>
<th>Treated equally</th>
<th>Treatment effect</th>
<th>Confidence limits</th>
<th>Applicability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Alparslan et al., 2016)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hou et al., 2014)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Mateu et al., 2018)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Akgün Şahin &amp; Dayapoğlu, 2015)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Chegeni et al., 2018)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Yilmaz &amp; Kapucu, 2017)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Beltung Nursing Journal
underlying reasons are cognitive problems, pain, and chronic disease (Lewis et al., 2014). In this review, not all of the participants were elderly. Progressive muscle relaxation is effective for all chronic disease patients regardless their age.

A multi-country study found that some chronic diseases had significant association with sleep problems. There were asthma, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), diabetes, and stroke (Koyanagi et al., 2014). In our review, of all six articles, three articles discussed the effectiveness of progressive muscle relaxation in COPD patients, one article in haemodialysis patients, one in low back pain patients, and the remaining articles in internal ward patients. Most of the participants suffered from COPD. There are several factors causing sleep disturbance among COPD patients, including cough, dyspnea, pleghm, wheeze, and use of corticosteroid inhaler (Chang et al., 2016; Omachi et al., 2012). In haemodialysis patients, sleep disturbance is associated with duration of the disease and pain (Pan et al., 2019). Pain intensity has dependent association with sleep disturbance although the correlation is weak (Alsaadi et al., 2011).

The effectiveness of progressive muscle relaxation in improving sleep quality is explained in several mechanisms. Progressive muscle relaxation could give a relaxation effect through distraction of attention and sensation of systemic tension and relaxation of the muscle (Bernstein et al., 2000). It also induces deep sleep by reducing the electrical activity in the inferior frontal gyrus (IFG), superior frontal gyrus (SFG) and posterior cingulate cortex (PCC) (Kobayashi & Koitabashi, 2016). This relaxation would decrease anxiety and depression as well as relieving insomnia symptom (Wolkove et al., 2007).

**Progressive muscle relaxation media**

Progressive muscle relaxation is one of the effective and safe methods for improving sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases either in a community setting or in a hospital setting. The positive effect of progressive muscle relaxation in sleep can be seen in 7 days. There is no adverse effect reported by all studies. Nurses could give progressive muscle relaxation for helping patients to manage their sleep impairment. Training of progressive muscle relaxation could be given as a part of discharge planning to enhance self-management at home which could improve quality of life (Zeng et al., 2014).

Progressive muscle relaxation is widely applicable in clinical settings. CD audio is most likely used as a medium. However, the use of CD audio in Indonesia would give more challenge because of technology barrier. Many of the hospitalized patients do not have device to use CD audio. Some studies used mp3 player for the patients. The cost needed to buy an mp3 player for each patient would increase the hospital burden. We need more advanced technology to solve this problem such as smartphone apps. This technology is more applicable due to the growing number of mobile owners in Indonesia. Recently, Indonesia becomes the fourth largest marketplace for mobile phone worldwide (Statista Research Department, 2020).

**Limitations of the study**

This review has several limitations including the narrow range of the study years and the use of English-based articles, which might exclude other important articles that use other languages.

**CONCLUSION**

Progressive muscle relaxation could improve sleep quality among patients with chronic diseases. There were variations in progressive muscle relaxation techniques, including variations in frequency in each day, muscle groups involved, and media. Despite the variance in progressive muscle relaxation methods, all studies reported significant results of progressive muscle relaxation in enhancing sleep quality among chronic disease patients.

**DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTEREST**

There is no conflict of interest to disclosure.

**FUNDING**

None.

**AUTHORS CONTRIBUTION**

SM: Done literature review, and drafted the manuscript.
SY: Contributed to design, methodology, discussion, and final proof of the manuscript.
DD: Analysed the manuscript.

**ORCID**

Syafa’atun Mirzanah https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1089-1201
Sri Yona http://orcid.org/0000-0001-9766-8880
Debie Dahlia http://orcid.org/0000-0002-7892-3070

**REFERENCES**


Beltung Nursing Journal
patients: results from the Dialysis Outcomes and Practice Patterns Study (DOPPS). Nephrology Dialysis Transplantation, 23(3), 998-1004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ndt/gfn630

Han, Bin, Zhi, Fu-Xiang, Shi, Chao, Wu, Heng-Lan, & Gu, Xiao-Hong. (2017). Association between serum vitamin D levels and sleep disturbance in hemodialysis patients. Nutrients, 9(2), 139. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu9020139


Shang, Bingshan, Yin, Hurui, Jia, Yong, Zhao, Jinping, Meng, Xiangfei, Chen, Li, & Liu, Peng. (2019). Nonpharmacological interventions to improve sleep in nursing home residents: A systematic review. Geriatric Nursing. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gerinurse.2019.01.001


